DECISION DELEGATED TO HEAD OF PLANNING

Application No:	**H04-0658-23**	**Applicant:**	**The Thomas Cowley High School**
Proposal:	Replacement windows and doors		
Location:	Thomas Cowley High School School Lane Donington		
Terminal Date:	15th September 2023		

Planning Policies

South East Lincolnshire Local Plan - Adopted: March 2019

01	Spatial Strategy
02	Development Management
03	Design of New Development
29	The Historic Environment

National Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework 2021

Sections 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2021)

Representations:

	Object	Support	No Obj.	Comments
PARISH COUNCIL	0	0	0	0
WARD MEMBER	0	0	0	0
HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT OFFICER	0	0	0	1

CASE OFFICER ASSESSMENT

Proposal

This planning application is for the replacement of windows and doors at Thomas Cowley High School, School Lane, Donington.

The proposal effectively takes the form of two distinct segments - those being;

A) The replacement of the windows and doors on the specifically grade II listed 'old school'; and
B) The replacement of windows on the 1970s glazed link extension to the west of the 'old school' building.

The existing windows in the old school are already of a hybrid timber outer, with metal inner frame construction. This application seeks more or less a like-for-like replacement in terms of frame style, featuring aluminium inner frames. The major difference, however, is the addition of top opening casement topper windows, incorporated into the like-for-like design of the windows on the Southern elevation. This is to allow ventilation of the old school, which does not currently enjoy the benefit of opening windows to the southern elevation. Furthermore, all windows are proposed to be finished in conservation double-glazing, featuring genuine glazing bars.

To the rear of the old school is an unattractive 1970s single extension that appears contemporary to the glazed link mentioned above. It shares a visual style with the glazed link. The application seeks to replace the existing metal casement windows and doors with similar, though less broad panels, framed in aluminium.

The replacement of the windows to the 1970s glass link requires consent because it is considered to be a curtilage listed structure. The applicant seeks to replace windows in a similar, though not like-for-like manner. The panes of the proposed windows will be less broad than is currently extant, and shall allow for top-opening on some windows, again for the benefit of ventilation where none is currently afforded. Double glazing in aluminium frames is the proposed medium to be used in this proposal.

Site Description

The Thomas Cowley School is a Grade II listed site within the Donington Conservation Area (DCA). The site itself contains 3 separately listed buildings. The principal of which and the building affected by this proposal is the 'old School' which is Grade II listed and described by Historic England like so:

"Founded by Thomas Cowley in 1719, partly rebuilt after a fire in 1812, altered C19 and C20. Red brown brick in English bond, ashlar and stucco dressings. Machine plain tiled roof with reused stone coped gables and decorative knops. Wooden bellcote with shaped lead roof. To the rear a tall wall stack. 2 storey, 6 bay front with ashlar plinth, first floor band and quoins. Timber dentillated eaves cornice. Central C19 lead roofed stucco porch with angle pilasters, plain frieze, moulded cornice to segmental pediment. Double half glazed doors with bordered lights. To left 3 and to right 2 large cross mullioned windows. To right a doorway with moulded ashlar surround and cornice, beyond a narrow C19 fixed light. To first floor are 6 two light casement windows. All windows have flat splayed brick arched heads with keyblocks and moulded ashlar cills. Above the door a C18 oval sundial, with inscription above. Beneath it a tablet records the foundation of the school by T. Cowley in 1719 and its rebuilding in AD 1812. On the quoins are many graffiti inscriptions, including a footprint dated 1795."

The Grade II listed North Wing of the school is described like so:

"Red brick with ashlar dressings, plain tile roof, with raised stone coped gables, finials and kneelers, one ashlar stack. L-plan. Single storey, 6 bay front, the right hand bay advanced and gabled. Plinth, stone bracketed chamfered eaves. Buttresses with raked tops. To right a Tudor arched door with moulded ashlar reveals, above a stepped ashlar panel containing foliage, inscription and date 1861. Above is a 3 light mullioned and transomed window. To left are 4 two light and a single 3 light similar window. All windows have chamfered ashlar surrounds. In the gables are 2 small square lights with diamond set quatrefoils. Interior of the hall has a fine hammer beam roof with moulded ashlar corbels. Built as an addition to T. Cowley's original foundation of 1719.

Finally, the also Grade II listed Youth Centre, described as:

"c.1861. Red brick in Flemish bond, ashlar dressings, tiled roof, stone coped gables, one circular cast iron louvred vent, one ashlar stack. L-plan. Single storey, 6 bay front, the right hand bay is advanced and separately gabled. In the angle 2 Tudor arched doorways with ashlar surrounds, leaf decoration in the spandrels, covered by a porch across the angle, with tiled roof supported on braced timber posts. To the left 4 ashlar cross mullioned windows, subdivided by raked buttresses. To the right a 3 light similar window and in the gable a rectangular leaded light. Built as an addition to T. Cowley's original foundation of 1719, as a Junior School."

The wider setting can be characterised mainly by C19th residential setting and the open playing field to the front. The school site itself is considered to be one of the most key listed buildings in the setting of the DCA, despite its distance from the centre of Donington.

The exact setting of the proposed works - the old school and the associated link building are both set far back into the site, well away from the public realm. Whilst both can be seen quite readily from the public realm, it is important to note that they are situated at such a distance that fine details would not be readily appreciable when viewing the site from the public realm.

History

H04-0617-91

Erection of dwellings. REFUSED on 16/07/1992

H04-0055-02

Change of use from residential to educational. APPROVED on 21/02/2002

H04-1312-03

New single storey library/museum and learning resource facility for community and school use and widen access road. REFUSED on 16/12/2003

H04-1313-03

Demolition of existing derelict cottage and section of front wall (conservation area consent). REFUSED on 16/12/2003

H04-0519-07

Single storey extension for use as IT room. REFUSED on 13/06/07

H04-0549-15

Demolition and site clearance of cottage. REFUSED on 06/07/2015

H04-0160-21

Replacement of windows and doors. Approved 01/04/2021

H04-0844-19

Demolish cottage to allow 2 classroom block with wc's. Approved 04/10/2019

H04-0568-23

Proposed replacement fencing to western boundary. REFUSED 15-08-23

Consultation Responses

Lincolnshire County Council Historic Environment Record

The application involves alterations to The Old School Building which is a grade II listed asset. The school was founded in 1719 and partly rebuilt after a fire in 1812 and has 19th and 20th century alterations. The applicant's heritage statement shows that '- much of the exterior fabric seen today is surviving from the early to mid-19th century with little major physical change from the original design and external layout, thus providing significant visual evidence as to the historical development of both the school and Donington more broadly.' The windows form part of the evidence for the building's historical development and are included within the listing description.

While it is accepted that there may be a need for replacement, removing the existing windows and replacing with new materials and alteration to the design represents a change to the historic fabric.

If permission is granted, then it is recommended that this change to the historic fabric is documented.

The HER officer then continues to request the imposition of a modified version of SHDC standard condition AR04 be imposed to ensure that a recording is taken of the building prior to development.

Planning Considerations

Heritage Impact

The Local Planning Authority does not consider there to be any detrimental impact upon the value or significance of the designated heritage asset or any other associated heritage assets on site or within the wider DCA. Whilst the proposal does represent a modernisation of materials on the site, and a minor design alteration to allow top openers throughout, it is considered that the material change to inner aluminium frames does not represent a major departure from the existing hybrid timber/metal frames and the proposed top opening windows have been designed in a sensitive manner which replicates the design of the existing windows. Whilst the designs would not be identical to the extant, the public benefit of allowing window ventilation at this school building, allowing for the continued and sustainable use of this public facility easily outweighs the minor discrepancy in design orthodoxy. Furthermore, the site is situated over 100m from the public realm and as such the minor alteration in character and materials will not be easily discernible from public realm views within the DCA.

As such, the impact upon the character and value of the asset is considered to be insignificant and supporting of the continued utilisation of the listed building, and therefore, the local planning authority concludes that the proposal assists in conserving the historic environment in line with the requirements of Policy 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan (2019) and Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2021) due to the lack of an appreciable impact.

Residential Amenity

The Local Planning Authority does not consider there to be any material risk to residential amenity presented by this application. The proposal seeks to make no external dimensional alterations to any structure on site and also does not seek the creation of any new and/or above ground floor window openings. Furthermore, the site is situated a substantial distance away from its nearest residential neighbour and is screened from view by the existence of multiple surrounding buildings within the school complex. Therefore, there can be no appreciable risk of material overlooking or overshadowing presented to any nearby residences by this proposal.

Conclusion

For the reasons outlined above, this application is considered to be in accordance with Policies 1, 2, 3 and 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan (2019) as well as Sections 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2021). Therefore, the application is recommended for approval.

Additional Considerations

Public Sector Equality Duty

In making this decision the Authority must have regard to the public sector equality duty (PSED) under s.149 of the Equalities Act. This means that the Council must have due regard to the need (in discharging its functions) to:
A. Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act
B. Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not. This may include removing or minimising disadvantages suffered by persons who share a relevant protected characteristic that are connected to that characteristic; taking steps to meet the special needs of those with a protected characteristic; encouraging participation in public life (or other areas where they are underrepresented) of people with a protected characteristic(s).
C. Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not including tackling prejudice and promoting understanding.

The protected characteristics are age, disability, gender reassignment, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex and sexual orientation.

The PSED must be considered as a relevant factor in making this decision but does not impose a duty to achieve the outcomes in s.149. It is only one factor that needs to be considered, and may be balanced against other relevant factors.

It is not considered that the recommendation in this case will have a disproportionately adverse impact on a protected characteristic.

Human Rights

In making a decision, the Authority should be aware of and take into account any implications that may arise from the Human Rights Act 1998. Under the Act, it is unlawful for a public authority such as South Holland District Council to act in a manner that is incompatible with the European Convention on Human Rights. The Authority is referred specifically to Article 8 (right to respect for private and family life) and Article 1 of the First Protocol (protection of property).

It is not considered that the recommendation in this case interferes with local residents' right to respect for their private and family life, home and correspondence, except insofar as it is necessary to protect the rights and freedoms of others (in this case, the rights of the applicant). The Council is also permitted to control the use of property in accordance with the general public interest and the recommendation is considered to be a proportionate response to the submitted application based on the considerations set out in this report.