DECISION DELEGATED TO DEVELOPMENT MANAGER

Application No:	H05-0291-20	**Applicant:**	The Vicar & Churchwardens Church of St Mary Fleet
Proposal:	Replacement of lead roof covering to north aisle with terne coated stainless steel.		
Location:	St Mary Magdalenes Church Church End Fleet		
Terminal Date:	4th June 2020		

Planning Policies

South East Lincolnshire Local Plan - Adopted: March 2019

01	Spatial Strategy
02	Development Management
03	Design of New Development
29	The Historic Environment

National Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework 2019

Sections 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2019)

Representations:

	Object	Support	No Obj.	Comments
PARISH COUNCIL	0	0	0	0
WARD MEMBER	0	0	0	0
OTHER STATUTORY BODIES	0	0	0	1

CASE OFFICER ASSESSMENT

Proposal

This is an application for full planning permission for the installation of a terne coated steel roof to replace the lead roof which was stolen recently. The Terne-coated stainless steel will seek to

replicate the look of the original lead roof and will feature traditional timber roll seams.

Site Description

The building is a Grade I listed church, with origins in the 12th Century, featuring C14th additions and a restorations completed in 1798, 1843 and 1860. The Historic England listing is as such:

"Parish church. c.1180-1190, mid C14, restored 1798, 1843 and 1860-2 by C. Bennett of Lynn. Limestone rubble and ashlar. Concrete tile and lead roofs with stone coped gables with cross finials and single small stacks to north-west and south-west. Nave with north and south aisles and south porch, chancel. Moulded plinth and regularly placed 2 stage buttresses run round the entire church. All the window tracery restored in C19. West front clasped by north and south aisles. String course rises under a large pointed late C14, heavily restored in C19, west window with 5 ogee headed, cusped lights with transom, panel tracery and hood mould. Pointed doorway to right with hood mould running into string course and plank door. Pointed window beyond with 3 cusped ogee headed lights, C19 tracery and hood mould. A similar window in the west of the north aisle. North side with 2 pointed windows to the right, each with 3 cusped ogee headed lights, C19 flowing tracery and hood mould. Pointed doorway to left with double chamfered surround, hood mould running into string course and double panelled doors. Truncated window above with pointed head, 3 cusped ogee headed lights, C19 flowing tracery and hood mould. 2 similar full length windows beyond. East end of north aisle with pointed window with 3 cusped elongated ogee headed lights, C19 geometric tracery and hood mould. Chancel rebuilt in 1843. North side of chancel with outline of 3 blocked arcade bays with hood moulds. 3 C19 windows, 2 with shallow triangular heads and 3 trefoil headed lights with geometrical tracery and hood mould. One to the left with pointed head, 3 ogee headed lights, C19 reticulated tracery, hood mould and head label stops. East end with large pointed window with 3 cusped ogee headed lights, C19 reticulated tracery, hood mould and head label stops. Small blind, cusped, ogee headed opening above. South-east buttress with ornate mid C14 cusped, crocketed and finialled niche. South side with pointed C19 window to the right with 2 pointed, cusped lights, quatrefoil, hood mould and head label stops. Eaves above this bay with foliate sculptured motifs of c.1190. 2 C19 windows to left with pointed heads, each with central ogee headed light, flanked by single round headed lights, flowing tracery and hood moulds. West end of south aisle with pointed window with 3 cusped, ogee headed lights, C19 flowing tracery and hood mould. South side with part of a blocked doorway to the right with fragmentary hood mould. 2 windows to the left with pointed heads, 3 cusped, ogee headed lights and C19 flowing tracery 2 similar windows beyond the gabled porch to left, the latter with small lancets in return walls. Pointed doorway with double chamfered head, semi-circular responds, hood mould and head label stops. Interior flanking stone benches and pointed double chamfered doorway with hood mould, head label stops and double plank doors. Interior 5 bay north and south arcades of c.1180 with tall round piers and semi-circular responds; pointed double chamfered heads. Chancel arch of c.1180 with semi-circular responds and pointed double chamfered head with hood mould. Windows in chancel with hood moulds and head label stops. Mid C14 sedilia restored C19 with 3 crocketed and finialled gables.Trefoiled heads beneath and ornate pinnacles. Piscina to left with ornate crocketed and finialled gable, trefoil head and damaged gables. C15 octagonal font with traceried panels and octagonal pedestal. C19 parclose screens. Early C14 sculptured fragment of robed figure. C19 reredos, altar rail, pews and choir stalls. C19 roofs supported on fine C14 stone corbels of crouching figures. 5 sided pulpit with fielded panels and plain pilasters; octagonal sounding board. Monuments include one in black and white marble to Hannah Frost, died 1831; one a white and black marble diamond to Thomas Bockington, died 1745. A white marble oval with draperies, cherub and cartouche to Wilhelmi Iaij, died 1706. Another in black and white marble with pediment to Richard Dods, died 1853."

The site is at the very heart of Fleet and forms perhaps the single most significant site within the associated conservation area. The Curtilage of the church also features the similarly Grade I listed separate Bell Tower which is intrinsically important to the character of the village and the site at large.

Furthermore, the site is within close proximity to several other listed buildings; those being the Grade II listed 'The Cottage' Hall Gate and the Grade I Listed 'Manor House', Hall Gate, which are both within visual range of the Church. Several 'Buildings of Local Heritage' also surround the site, including the large and locally significant Battleford Hall/Old Rectory, which is directly adjacent to the Church Yard.

Otherwise, the area immediately surrounding the site can be characterised by a mix of open countryside and small scale residential development, of varying periods and styles.

History

H05-0205-15

Works to trees in the grounds of St. Mary Magdalene's Church, Fleet. APPROVED on 08/04/2015

Consultation Responses

Historic England

Refer to page 6, section 2 of advice note 'Metal Theft from Historic Buildings: Prevention, Response and Recovery' (July 2017) which states 'where the risk of theft is too high following a serious theft , or repeated minor attacks, it is not reasonable to expect like for like replacement of stolen lead...' Section 3.2 on page 10 also states that 'Terne-coated stainless steel is the most popular long-term alternative to lead and offers advantages over other options, including a similar appearance'. Terne-Coates stainless steel is amongst the most appropriate alternatives to lead, alongside zinc, slates or tiles.

Historic England recommends round batten rolls as opposed to standing seams in such cases to preserve similarity of appearance and performance when compared with lead. The applicant has not specified which seam style is proposed.

Planning Considerations

Heritage Impact

St Mary Magdalene's Church is Grade I listed and therefore, the greatest level of consideration must be afforded to the impact upon the significance of the asset which these proposals will have. Whilst, of course, the loss of traditional materials at this site is regrettable, it is considered that the terne-coated stainless steel will have a negligible impact upon the appearance of the structure. Historic England's guidance note 'Metal Theft from Historic Buildings: Prevention, Response and Recovery' (July 2017) states in reference to terne-coated stainless steel the ' is the most popular long-term alternative to lead and offers advantages over other options, including similar appearance'. This, coupled with Historic England's comment that terne-coated stainless steel is an appropriate alternative to lead, suggests that the proposals are wholly acceptable from a heritage conservation standpoint, especially when balanced with the public benefit of preventing further damage to the building and further theft from the building which is a community asset.

Reinforcing this is the fact that following Historic England's suggestion that the seam type should be defined, the applicant has confirmed that timber rolls will be used, rather than the less preferable standing seam.

Conclusion

For the reasons listed above, it is determined that this application is in accordance with policies 1, 2, 3 and 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan (2019) and Sections 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2019). Therefore this application is recommended for APPROVAL.

Additional Considerations

Public Sector Equality Duty

In making this decision the Authority must have regard to the public sector equality duty (PSED) under s.149 of the Equalities Act. This means that the Council must have due regard to the need (in discharging its functions) to:
A. Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act
B. Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not. This may include removing or minimising disadvantages suffered by persons who share a relevant protected characteristic that are connected to that characteristic; taking steps to meet the special needs of those with a protected characteristic; encouraging participation in public life (or other areas where they are underrepresented) of people with a protected characteristic(s).
C. Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not

including tackling prejudice and promoting understanding.

The protected characteristics are age, disability, gender reassignment, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex and sexual orientation.

The PSED must be considered as a relevant factor in making this decision but does not impose a duty to achieve the outcomes in s.149. It is only one factor that needs to be considered, and may be balanced against other relevant factors.

It is not considered that the recommendation in this case will have a disproportionately adverse impact on a protected characteristic.

Human Rights

In making a decision, the Authority should be aware of and take into account any implications that may arise from the Human Rights Act 1998. Under the Act, it is unlawful for a public authority such as South Holland District Council to act in a manner that is incompatible with the European Convention on Human Rights. The Authority is referred specifically to Article 8 (right to respect for private and family life) and Article 1 of the First Protocol (protection of property).

It is not considered that the recommendation in this case interferes with local residents' right to respect for their private and family life, home and correspondence, except insofar as it is necessary to protect the rights and freedoms of others (in this case, the rights of the applicant). The Council is also permitted to control the use of property in accordance with the general public interest and the recommendation is considered to be a proportionate response to the submitted application based on the considerations set out in this report.